

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

### MPO Organization and Structure

- What is the voting structure of the TAC? What is the process for nominating public members of the TAC? How often do the agencies represented on the TAC change?

The TAC follows Robert's Rules of Order where the Chair will ask for a motion and a second. If there is a second, an action is approved by a simple majority.

Pursuant to the Rules and Standards of the State Planning Council, members of the TAC are appointed by the State Planning Council. Membership of the TAC is governed by the Rules and Standards of the State Planning Council which states that the TAC shall consist of one representative each from RIPTA, RIDOT, the RI Department of Environmental Management, and the RI Commerce Corporation. The Narragansett Indian Tribe is also represented on the TAC. Thus, a representative from one of these agencies must be replaced by another employee of that agency. The organizations rarely change but sometimes their representatives leave and must be replaced. For the other members who leave, MPO staff will work with the organization to have another representative of that organization complete the term. MPO staff also make recommendations to the State Planning Council on the make up of the membership. Staff tries to have a balanced membership from a diverse set of transportation stakeholders including the Rhode Island Trucking Association, Rhode Island Chapter of the American Planning Association, AAA, bicycle advocates, public transit advocates, smart growth advocates, suburban and urban municipal officials, the Governor's Commission on the Disabled, RI Association of Railroad Passengers, and Rhode Island Society of Civil Engineers.

### Civil Rights and Public Participation

- Does the Council measure the effectiveness of their public involvement efforts?

Yes: staff distributes Attendee Feedback questionnaires at public hearings and select public meetings. Participation is voluntary.

- What are the recent results of the exit surveys/ annual reviews described on pg. 11 of the Public Participation Plan? How does the Council use these results?

Data collected and available to the Title VI Manager consisted of thirty-three completed Attendee forms from three public hearings and six public information meetings and workshops from 12/2015 through 12/2016.

The three main principles evaluated were:

#### 1. Information Dissemination

- Were the participants satisfied with the availability of information?
- Was the information provided in a timely manner?
- Was notice to actively participate effective?

Most of the responses to the questions on Information Dissemination were positive ones. Email and Other were the two categories indicated as sources of information on the events. Where "Other" was indicated, some respondents specified Website, Facebook, posters, and newspaper.

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

### 2. Consultation

- Was there meaningful information and dialogue exchanged?
- Did the participants believe the event was at a time and location that was convenient?
- Did the outreach achieve desired outcomes such as was the event beneficial and provide information that was helpful to the participant?
- Is the public participation more demographically balanced such as more participation of the underserved and minority populations?
- Is there a measurable trend of increased attendance/participation? (collected separately)

The answers provided under Consultation indicate the following:

The attendees survey responses clearly show that the events were held at a convenient time and venue and they experienced a meaningful dialogue. The information and event were deemed beneficial to them. Attendees who responded were White, non-Hispanic with an even number of male and female attendees. The majority were in the income bracket of over \$35,000. The language spoken at home was English. These results indicate that the participation of minority and the traditionally underserved population is very low or absent and more targeted outreach methods may need to be explored and executed to increase participation.

### 3. Stakeholder Participation

- Were the participants satisfied with the opportunity to offer input?
- Did they believe their opinions were heard and mattered?

The attendees survey responses clearly show that they experienced a meaningful dialogue at events that were held. The information and event was deemed beneficial to them.

Attendance records that were available to the Title VI Manager show no measurable trend of increased attendance or participation by the public. The analysis of public participation is also part of the MPO's Title VI report to RIDOT.

- The PPP describes public workshops, focus groups, local public meetings, and consultations as forms of public involvement that the council considers. How are these strategies implemented?

The type and methods of public engagement meetings that are utilized are determined on a case by case basis, dependent on the plan or project, the scope and by direction of the project manager and or steering committee.

- How does the public involvement process demonstrate explicit consideration and responsiveness to public and interested parties' input received during the planning and program development process?

Comments received as part of a formal comment period are summarized in the public hearing report along with the response. Written summary reports of all public hearings are provided to the TAC and State Planning Council prior to its acting. Any updates, drafts or revisions to planning documents are also made available for the public for review and comment. In the case that the final planning documents differ significantly from the version that was made available to the public, additional opportunity for public comment will be

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

considered. Public input is a critical component of the development of the LRTP. There have been numerous public workshop events held throughout the State to seek public input on their perspective on the future of Rhode Island's transportation system. The public also has the chance to review and make suggested revisions to the draft plan. Staff reviews all of the comments and refines the draft accordingly.

- What kind of feedback do the public/interested parties receive on the proposals and questions they put forward?

A record is kept of all public meetings and a response to questions and comments is made public within a reasonable time, depending on the nature of the project and public involvement meeting. In the case of public hearings, a Public Hearing Report is prepared and posted on the Statewide Planning Division's Website, generally within fourteen days. Regarding the LRTP and Bicycle Master Plan, the results of the public work sessions and survey results are posted on the project website including scans and summary notes.

- How does the MPO evaluate the effectiveness of the public involvement process, specifically its outreach efforts to encourage participation and involvement of traditionally underserved (Title VI/Nondiscrimination) populations?

Please see answer to Question #1. There are demographic questions in our Attendee Feedback survey.

- How do you determine which languages are spoken in the TMA and decide which resources should be provided in those languages?

The MPO conducted a recent update to the demographic profile of the TMA along with LEP data. Please see the LRTP at <http://www.planning.ri.gov/documents/trans/2017/LRTP-37.pdf> and the STIP at [http://www.planning.ri.gov/documents/tip/2017/TIP\\_FULL\\_12\\_19\\_17.pdf](http://www.planning.ri.gov/documents/tip/2017/TIP_FULL_12_19_17.pdf) A notice is provided in our public hearing and public workshop advertisements that allows the public to request language interpretation and translation services prior to the meeting. A LEP Plan was developed to aid Statewide Planning in these decisions.

- Does the MPO have a documented method to ensure equity of projects advanced by local governments, specifically about the demographics served by each project or the history of projects selected in the TIP?

No.

- What factors are considered to determine the equity of TIP projects across the region?

A Transportation Equity Analysis was conducted during the preparation of the STIP [http://www.planning.ri.gov/documents/tip/2017/TIP\\_FULL\\_12\\_19\\_17.pdf](http://www.planning.ri.gov/documents/tip/2017/TIP_FULL_12_19_17.pdf) The number of projects and funds invested are used in helping determine equity.

- Geographic distribution? Project value? Community needs addressed? Federal, state, and local transportation initiatives/objectives advanced?

Yes, to all the above. Although geographic distribution of STIP projects is not regulated or controlled in any fashion by the State, there is a project solicitation process for local

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

government, private and State agencies to submit projects into the STIP. In addition, RIDOT maintains a ten-year plan that is asset management based and that identifies Federal, state, and local transportation initiatives and objectives in several program categories that are to be advanced in the STIP.

- What steps are taken to encourage participation in the Federal Aid Highway Program among communities that are not advancing such projects?

All communities/local governments receive direct invitations to participate.

- How does the MPO ensure that its facilities, specifically those for public meetings, are made accessible to persons with disabilities?

In most cases, staff have visited the venues and the MPO has used the same venues on a repeat basis. In a case where we have not used the venue prior to a meeting, we have verified ADA with managers of the site.

- What protocols are followed to ensure auxiliary aids and services are available to the public?

We have placed ADA notification in all public hearing advertisements. A five (5) day advanced notice is requested. We have an ADA coordinator in Statewide Planning. He/she communicates with an ADA Coordinator in the Department of Administration who has access to equipment and services along with a Master Price (MPA) Agreement with private vendors.

- Has the MPO conducted a comprehensive Four-factor Analysis to determine the extent of its LEP obligations?

Yes.

- Has the MPO utilized this analysis to develop a Language Access Plan?

Yes.

- Has the MPO surveyed all public meeting places to ensure interior and exterior access, including van accessible parking, to persons with disabilities?

No. However, most of the meeting places are used on a regular basis by this office and all are fully ADA accessible.

- Has the MPO's Title VI complaint handling process been vetted and approved by RIDOT?

Yes. It is part of our reporting.

- Does the MPO collect and analyze data consistent with all persons protected under Title VI and the Nondiscrimination Statutes?

Yes, through the US Census 10-year survey and ACS 5-year estimates.

- Has the MPO conducted a program distribution analysis to determine if there any apparent disparities with respect to Title VI/Nondiscrimination Populations?

Yes, it was done in the most recent STIP's Transportation Equity Benefit Analysis (TEBA).

There was an E.J. case study conducted as part of the preparation of the Interim Long-Range

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

Transportation Plan:

[http://www.planning.ri.gov/documents/tip/2017/TIP\\_FULL\\_12\\_19\\_17.pdf](http://www.planning.ri.gov/documents/tip/2017/TIP_FULL_12_19_17.pdf)

- What metrics were used to determine equity in the program?
  - Select population groups (SPG) identified in the population identification component, the Census tracts with populations at or above the state average for each SPG.
  - TEBA utilized project costs within seven of the STIP's funding programs
  - Total Number of Projects
- For any disparities identified, briefly describe the plan of action.

We do not know of any past identified disparity. However, if a situation arose, we would coordinate with our partners (RIDOT, RIPTA, and municipalities) to address any identified issues associated with a project that might adversely impact a disadvantaged community.

- How does the MPO define its Title VI/Nondiscrimination populations?

Title VI covers all populations, including minority populations that are defined by the U.S. Government. Nondiscrimination populations are those covered by U.S. Statutes and Executive Orders which are described at: <http://www.planning.ri.gov/public-participation/title-vi-civil-rights.php>

### Freight

- Since the State Freight Plan has been approved for FAST Act compliance what has been the next steps on freight planning in RI?

Due to staffing shortages with freight expertise/familiarity in 2016-2017 or since the approval of the State Freight Plan minimal work has been done to advance freight. The MPO's FY 2019 UPWP will however contain three key freight projects. These projects include the following:

- Conduct Freight Scans in municipalities of key freight importance. These scans will have the purpose of better equipping and educating municipal departments, particularly planning, with an increased understanding of freight movements in their community and to provide them with a greater capacity to address freight issues. The Division of Planning will focus on the municipality's freight activity for a one-month period. The Division of Planning staff will meet with the municipal planning staff members at the beginning of the month for an orientation and discussion about the desired outcomes of the program, and then again at the end of the month for a wrap-up and presentation of findings. Some of the activities undertaken within the month could include:
  - Review the freight/transportation components/element of the municipal comprehensive plan.
  - Conduct meetings with key local freight stakeholders within that municipality.
  - Prepare municipal specific freight data originating from the Freight and Goods Movement Plan.

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

- Organize field views of representative freight facilities in that municipality.
- Documented signature supply chain chase studies.

The Division of Planning staff would also assemble mapping information in GIS regarding major transportation facilities, freight generators, and special areas (ports, industrial locations, etc.) within the specific municipality.

After the scan, Division of Planning staff will prepare a freight-related brochure for that specific municipality. This brochure will provide useful guidance for the municipality in attempting to balance freight operations with community goals, plans, and projects. The scans could also serve as a potential basis for the preparation of suggested new transportation studies, recommended system improvements, refine the vision for growth and development, for the long-range transportation plan and as a tool to better educate the public, especially area businesses and residents.

- Freight Finder Online Mapper - Make RI freight transportation data public, utilizing an Open Freight App framework that utilizes existing data sets from Rhode Island Freight & Goods Movement Plan. This mapper will be available on the Division's website and targeted at other planners, economic developers, public officials, decision-makers that can serve to improve the access to information on freight facilities and their role in economic development and transportation in RI to help make better informed decisions.
- Update to the State Rail Plan which includes freight rail.
- Has the Freight Advisory Committee reconvened? And if so how have they furthered the efforts of implementing the SFP or other funding opportunities? Were there any Freight projects proposed for the INFRA Grant or TIGER Grant?
  - The Freight Advisory Committee was formally established by the Rhode Island State Planning Council in 2017, however due to staffing limitations the Committee has not reconvened. We anticipate that the Committee will be convened in 2018 especially as it relates to the freight projects anticipated for the FY 2019 UPWP (see response above).
  - RIDOT applied for an INFRA grant for improvements of the I-95 Providence Viaduct Northbound. RIDOT applied for a TIGER grant application for improvements to the Route 37 Corridor in Cranston and Warwick. While there are freight implications to both grants (given that they are major highways with significant freight routes), there weren't specific freight components in either of the grant applications RIDOT submitted.
- How is the state and MPO preparing to meet national freight performance goals? Has the state and MPO agreed on performance goals on Freight? How is SPP and the state with utilizing sufficient freight data?
  - The MPO and RIDOT will be hiring a consultant to help set the targets for the following:
    - Percent of person-miles traveled on the Interstate NHS that are reliable
    - Percent of person-miles traveled on the non-Interstate NHS that are reliable
    - Truck Travel Time Reliability Index (TTTR)

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

- The State and Goods Movement Plan identifies the following freight goals for Rhode Island, which will be reflected in the LRTP:
  - Operational efficiency
  - Economic growth and development
  - Connectivity
- The MPO will make use of the freight data collected for the Freight Plan in the Freight Scan project and in the online Freight Finder mapping application that will be included in the FY 2019 UPWP. It is acknowledged that a plan needs to be arrived on how to collect the freight related data on a consistent basis and to use it towards specific purposes to advance freight initiatives.
- During the Megaregion's conference this past August 2017, there were a number of states that were interested meeting together to explore opportunities to coordinating or collaborating on freight and megaregional issues. Has there been any follow up since then? Is RI still interested in exploring opportunities to coordination on freight and megaregional issues with other states in New England and the North East?
  - We scheduled a MPO coordination meeting in January 2018 and freight was scheduled to be one of the topics discussed: however, the meeting was canceled due to bad weather.
  - Yes, there is definite interest to coordinate with neighboring states on freight issues.
- Is there thing that RI or SPP can think of that the federal partners can provide assistance on Freight Planning? Training? Peer Exchange? Technical Support? Program evaluation? Innovative Financing? Truck, Size, & Weight assistance?
  - Yes: Federal assistance would be helpful on how to set up a consistent source to collect and use the data for effective planning. And how to market freight planning as an important activity that supports economic development.

### **Performance Based Planning and Programming**

- Does your agency's performance-based approach lead to decision-making to support the national goals identified in 23 U.S.C. 150(b)? What is the MPO's current thinking and plans to incorporate the national goals in on-going metropolitan planning?

To incorporate the national goals in ongoing metropolitan planning the Division of Planning has included corresponding performance measures in the currently underway 2040 Long Range Transportation Plan, expected to be complete by the end of calendar year 2018. See below for a compendium of LRTP performance measures as they address national goals. As the plan is still being developed, the non-federal performance measures could change from what is shown below. These goals and performance measures also influence the selection of projects to be funding through the STIP. Specific targets are in the process of being determined.

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

National Goal	LRTP Proposed Performance Measures
To achieve a significant reduction in traffic fatalities and serious injuries on public roads	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Number of annual traffic fatalities</li> <li>- Number of annual traffic serious injuries</li> <li>- Rate of annual traffic fatalities per VMT</li> <li>- Rate of annual traffic serious injuries per VMT</li> <li>- Number of pedestrian/bicyclist annual traffic fatalities and serious injuries</li> </ul>
To maintain the highway infrastructure asset system in a state of good repair	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Percentage of pavement on the interstate system in good condition</li> <li>- Percentage of pavement on the interstate system in poor condition</li> <li>- Percentage of pavement on the non-interstate NHS in good condition</li> <li>- Percentage of pavement on the non-interstate NHS in poor condition</li> <li>- Percentage of NHS bridges in good condition</li> <li>- Percentage of NHS bridges in poor condition</li> <li>- Percentage of deck area of bridges classified as structurally deficient</li> </ul>
To achieve a significant reduction in congestion on the National Highway System	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Percentage of population within 1/4 mile of public transportation or growth center</li> <li>- Percentage of non-SOV mode share</li> <li>- Number of regional non-SOV trips offered daily</li> <li>- Vehicle miles traveled annually</li> </ul>
To improve the efficiency of the surface transportation system	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Percent of person-miles traveled that are reliable</li> <li>- Number of bottlenecks on truck routes</li> <li>- Number of bottlenecks</li> <li>- Truck travel time reliability index</li> <li>- Percentage of non-SOV mode share</li> </ul>

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

<p>To improve the national freight network, strengthen the ability of rural communities to access national and international trade markets, and support regional economic development</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Percentage of population within 1/4 mile of public transportation or growth center</li> <li>- Number of bottlenecks on truck route</li> <li>- Volume of freight cargo</li> <li>- Value of freight cargo</li> <li>- Truck Travel Time Reliability Index</li> </ul>
<p>To enhance the performance of the transportation system while protecting and enhancing the natural environment</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Percentage of non-SOV mode share</li> <li>- Percentage of population within 1/4 mile of public transportation or growth center</li> <li>- number of regional non-SOV trips offered daily</li> <li>- Percent of person-miles traveled on the interstate that are reliable</li> <li>- Percent of person-miles traveled on the non-interstate that are reliable</li> </ul>
<p>To reduce project costs, promote jobs and the economy, and expedite the movement of people and goods by accelerating project completion through eliminating delays in the project development and delivery process, including reducing regulatory burdens and improving agencies' work practices</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Balance of annual transportation budget expenditures</li> <li>- Number of bottlenecks on truck route</li> </ul>

- Have the MPO and local planning partners identified staffing and organizational capacity changes needed to implement performance based planning within the region?

The MPO acknowledges that staffing resources must be reprioritized and that changes will have to be made to implement and track performance based planning. However, throughout the course of the federal roll-out of the MAP-21 and FAST Act PBPP, MPO staff met consistently with RIDOT, along with some support from the FHWA RI Division Office, regarding how to best address the MAP-21 performance based planning requirements. We envision that this collaborative approach will continue and expand as we direct more resources towards PBPP.

- When developing an official cooperative agreement or memorandum of understanding with the MPO, State, and partner agencies, do the MPO and its partners formalize roles and responsibilities for developing goals with performance measures and targets?

The MPO, along with its partner agencies RIDOT, RIPTA, and RIDEM is still currently working on formalizing roles and responsibilities regarding developing goals with performance

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

measures and targets. We have been operating collaboratively and cooperatively on these efforts but it is becoming more apparent that more formalized roles and responsibilities need to be identified especially when it relates to paying for consultant services and data sources for the performance based data. MOUs between the MPO and RIDOT have been executed for some of the performance based planning metrics as we have moved forward with the various measures and targets. However, it is acknowledged that a bigger picture approach to the task needs to be realized.

- How are the goals, objectives, measures, and targets that are described in other State transportation plans or public transit plans, as well as related transportation processes integrated in the metropolitan transportation planning process?

Rhode Island has a reciprocal system of land use planning whereby the State sets broad goals and policies through the State Guide Plan and municipalities express local desires and conditions through the development of local comprehensive plans. These local comprehensive plans serve as the basis for land use regulation and establish an implementation program for achieving each community stated goals. The local comprehensive plans are reviewed by the State, and when approved, become binding on the State agencies by requiring conformance to their programs and projects to the comprehensive plan. This is a great process for coordination planning between state and municipal governments and a unique relationship between an MPO and its member local governments. Having a state where the MPO, RIDOT and RIPTA all have the exact same service area is an amazing leg up in our ability to coordinate. But adding to that, the staff of the MPO also oversee the reciprocal comprehensive planning system is very beneficial for creating the essential link between transportation, land use, and those who make most land use decision: local governments.

A Compendium of Plans that has been developed as part of the update to the LRTP. This Compendium includes a review of all relevant State plans related to transportation such as Freight and Goods Movement Plan and Greenhouse Gas Reduction Plan. This Compendium has been used by the Moving Forward team to consider the goals, objectives, metrics, and targets of various plans. In addition, the LRTP performance measures will be developed concurrent with our Performance Based Planning and Programming Process. MPO staff are working with RIDOT to establish performance targets.

- Is the MPO beginning to develop a process to track and report progress towards achieving targets?

The MPO is currently still in the phase of identifying the measures of performance and targets through the development of the LRTP update. Once the measures of performance and targets have been identified then we will develop a process to track and report progress on the targets. An online performance based planning dashboard, that is updated annually is envisioned to be forum for tracking and reporting on the targets.

- How will your agency use performance measures and targets to inform decision-making in the TIP or elsewhere?

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

The MPO's FY 2019 UPWP will include a task to modify the project selection criteria for the TIP so that it is aligned with the performance measures and targets identified in the LRTP. TIP application's will be scored against the specific goals, measures, and targets. Assigning scores to the applications will allow the MPO to determine which project will provide the state with the best potential return on investment per the various transportation programs.

### Metropolitan Transportation Plan

- What is the status of your travel demand model, and what challenges have you encountered in gathering data for the model?

The DOP is currently in the process of updating the model, including data validation. Updating of the model will be continuous which will ensure improvements as well as having up-to-date data. In addition, Division of Planning staff will be offering Core User Training in February and March for all travel demand model stakeholders with the intent of showing the users how to get the most out of the model.

The Rhode Island Statewide Model (RISM) is currently meeting the travel demand planning needs of the state. As it stands, model accuracy meets industry standards for the Interstates. The Division of Planning has been making improvements in the model consistently over the last 4 years and has plans for continued improvements. These improvements include architectural and data. The architectural improvements are being addressed by the Division as part of an ongoing process of incremental improvements. A full discussion of this process can be found in the Model Maintenance Plan, and there is strong support in the Division for continuing this process.

However data improvements are often difficult, due to the large resource requirements. Of these the most expensive, at least on a per unit basis, is the household survey. The state has not completed a household survey in many years due to the estimated price of around \$200,000. A household survey is important as it helps to calibrate the RISM to the behavior of the public, by identifying the Origins and Destinations of travel (OD data). It also helps to set assumptions about travel behavior, such as mode choice, costs of travel, etc. The biggest hole in this data has been a lack of OD data. The Division has been working with RIDOT to see if it would be possible to acquire OD data from a cell phone probe contractor, but as of right now the process for hiring a cell phone probe contractor is very unclear as a result of the RIDOT's uncertainty with securing the NPMRDS/INRIX data.

Finally, traffic counts are provided by RIDOT for the calibration of the model, in the form of the AADTs from the HPMS submission. Counts are done when necessary for a construction project, and not in way that provides a systematic look at the highway system. RIDOT staff have prepared a plan for a more systematic application of roadway counts and we very strongly encourage the adoption of this plan.

- It appears that the statewide LRTP and MTP is a single joint document- How do you ensure the requirements of both are met? What kind of coordination occurs between MPO staff and RIDOT planning staff in developing the plan?

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

We are creating a single document called the Long-Range Transportation Plan 2040 and are ensuring we are meeting the requirements of various federal codes including 49 USC 5303(i), 23 USC 134, 23 USC 135. The new plan will meet all the FAST Act requirements for the plans including performance based planning and programming. RIDOT and RIPTA are both active members of the LRTP Core Team and Internal Team which allows them opportunities to coordinate with our consultants and staff, weigh in on deliverables, provide professional recommendations, help stakeholders at public events, coordinate with performance metrics, and help with the financial projections of the plan.

- What prompts the MPO to develop a new MTP as opposed to updating the existing plan?

We decided to develop a new MPT because the current LRTP was developed many years ago and needs to be updated to reflect not only new conditions but also to determine the State's perspective regarding the future transportation system. The 2037 plan is an update of the 2035 and 2030 plans thus enough time has elapsed to necessitate a full revision. This also compels the need to update the plan's vision, goals, objectives, actions and projects. It was also important to update the plan to reflect the FAST Act performance metric requirements.

- What has the MPO's approach been to monitoring the implementation of strategies identified in the MTP?

There is an alignment between the LRTP and the TIP. For example, LRTP 2035 references the need for numerous projects that were then added to the TIP including the Pawtucket/Central Fall Transit Stop, Downtown Transit Connector, and the I-95 Viaduct. An environmental analysis, including sea-level rise and environmental justice, is also a required component of both the LRTP and TIP; thus, project review is consistent for both.

The new plan will have a detailed implementation chapter that will have a work plan structure that will identify tasks, responsible entities, and deadlines. The plan will identify lead partners as well as assisting partners. The plan will also have reporting mechanism such as an annual report, consistent with performance metric reporting requirements, that will identify actions achieved, measuring appropriate metrics to determine how well the State is achieving the goals of the plan, and determine appropriate actions needed to move forward. This report will be submitted to the State Planning Council annually. The plan will also be consulted as a measure to determine project selection as part of the TIP process. In addition, projects and programs that implement the LRTP will be part of future UPWPs.

- How is the CMP integrated into the region's planning process?

Rhode Island's Congestion Management Process (CMP), as outlined by the Division of Planning, includes strategies to improve the performance of existing transportation facilities to relieve vehicular and truck congestion and maximize safety and mobility for people and goods. The Congestion Management Task Force (CMTF) is the primary vehicle for the implementation of Rhode Island's CMP. The CMTF typically meets on a quarterly basis. Its last meeting was held in November 2017 and its next meeting is scheduled for early March 2018. It combines resources currently used to monitor both recurring and non-recurring congestion, and supplements that with staff from the Division of Planning, RIDOT's Maintenance, Traffic Management Center, Design, Office of Transit Planning, Traffic Safety,

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

and Performance Management divisions, RI Department of Environmental Management, and RIPTA as partners and collaborators.

The State is in the process of revising the CMP process, which will be later integrated into LRTP 2040. As shown on the proposed comprehensive update to the CMP, the process will include developing objectives and strategies for congestion management, define the geography, data collection, develop performance measures, and implementation strategies, including evaluation measures. When the CMTF met in November 2017, the focus of the meeting was on performance metrics and targets related to congestion. The CMTF will continue to meet on a quarterly, or more frequent basis as work advances on the new CMP.

The revised LRTP will also include operational and management objectives and strategies that focus on improving congestion on our transportation facilities. These strategies will include the identification and prioritization of capital projects, including funding sources, that can improve the capacity of a roadway, transit, as well as pedestrian and cycling. The plan will also include metrics that focus on congestion such as Annual Hours of Peak Hour Excessive Delay per Capita and Percent of Person-Miles Traveled on Interstate and Non-Interstate that are Reliable. These metrics will be reported on an annual basis as part of an annual report. Depending on how well the State is achieving the various goals of the LRTP, additional actions may need to be implemented to ensure successful outcomes. It is envisioned the congestion management process will be specifically identified as an implementation program and will include actions, lead organization and partners and deadlines.

- It looks like RI is addressing sea level rise, what is the coordination with other agencies responsible for emergency management or evacuation relating to resilience?

RI has been a leader in its attempts to come to grips with the implications of Sea Level Rise. In the wake of Superstorm Sandy, numerous agencies around the state began to make efforts to come to grips with the problem. Officially, these efforts have been coordinated through the Executive Climate Change Council (EC4), an organization of high level agency officials. In addition, an ad-hoc group of mid-level employees who run the climate change and resilience projects began to meet monthly. This group shares presentations on ongoing projects and best practices and has proved vital in making sure the employees at the various agencies know what work is being done, and in encouraging the ongoing work. The Division of Statewide Planning has played a lead role in coordinating and encouraging both these groups in their ongoing efforts.

The state has a fairly robust method for modeling oceanic sea level rise in a GIS environment thanks to the STORMTOOLS data set. This has allowed some work to be done at identifying vulnerable transportation assets by the Division of Statewide Planning. RIDOT is now working on taking this data and working on finding ways to integrate this information into their work. The Division of Statewide Planning is actively participating in this project in an advisory role.

The team at the University of Rhode Island which developed STORMTOOLS has begun work to incorporate riverine flooding into the model. They are in the final stages of a pilot project and are ready to take the work statewide, but the funding is now exhausted.

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

The logical next step will be incorporating the information about sea level rise into the STIP process. Given that the municipalities often lack awareness of, or resources for responding to, SLR issues, it is likely that the State will have to act to require or impose resiliency improvements.

- What is the current methodology for the MTP update? Explain:

- Anticipated years being used for updated data and information.

The consultant team has developed both a baseline conditions and trends report (issued in November 2017) using best available data. The data in the baseline conditions report are from 2016 and 2017. The trends report projects conditions out to the plan horizon year of 2040.

Currently the travel demand model uses a base year of 2010 with forecast years of 2015, 2020, 2025, 2030, 2035, and 2040. Ongoing efforts are being made to upgrade the travel demand model to a 2015 base year, but that may take some time. A more thorough upgrade is planned to bring the base year to 2020 upon the release of the decennial census.

- Development of MPO performance measures and targets or adoption of State performance measures or targets

A Compendium of Plans that has been developed as part of the update to the LRTP. This Compendium includes a review of all relevant State plan's goals and objectives related to transportation such as the State Rail Plan, Freight and Goods Movement Plan and Greenhouse Gas Reduction Plan. This Compendium has been used by the Moving Forward team to consider the goals, objectives, metrics, and targets of various plans. In addition, the LRTP performance measures will be developed concurrent with our Performance Based Planning and Programming Process. MPO staff are working with RIDOT to establish performance targets.

### **Transportation Improvement Program**

- Last May, in developing their 5307 grant RIPTA was required to remove most of their desired projects from their grant application because those projects were not reflected in the FY17 STIP and the expired FY16 STIP was attached to the grant. What process is used to determine what transit projects will be included on the STIP and in what year?

The basis of the STIP is RIDOT and RIPTA's 10-year capital and operating plans. These plans are developed and approved by the respective agencies and forwarded to SPP for inclusion in the STIP. If a project from a previous, expiring STIP, is anticipated to roll into a subsequent year or implementation is delayed, the project would normally be included in a STIP amendment or included in a future 10-year plan, which either way would make it into the STIP. There is also a public solicitation for transit projects and these are considered separately from RIPTA's 10-year plan, these projects are evaluated by a transit subcommittee comprised of DOT, RIPTA, SPP, and TAC members.

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

As noted, RIPTA was unable to grant some projects in 2017 because they were in the lapsing 2016 TIP and did not get carried forward into the new 2017 TIP. This was a one-year issue due to the timing and complexities of changing from a four-year to a one-year annual TIP in a year with Continuing resolution funding. Due to uncertainty about how the timing of the new 10-year TIP would relate to the grant application schedule, RIPTA opted to place the carryover in FFY 2018.

- Explain the TIP and the project grouping.

The TIP is RI's 10-year transportation investment program. The STIP includes the 4-yr federally constrained revenue years and 6 out years representing a 10-year investment outlook. The Projects are first grouped by agency, DOT and RIPTA, and then consolidated into programs illustrative of RIDOT and RIPTA's management structure. To track total investment and improve transparency on project development and implementation, nearly all projects are included in the STIP, even if federal monies are yet to be anticipated as a funding source.

- Most projects in the TIP either list "construction" as a phase or leave the box blank, how does the TIP account for projects under development?

If "construction" is noted, then funds will be put toward construction. If "construction" is not listed, funds will be put toward planning, design, and construction. With cooperation from DOT, SPP is continuing to update this information and will include new project information as STIP updates are undertaken.

- In the TIP, some projects such as ID 5011, ID 7150, ID 1308 and ID 9201 do not list specific Federal funding programs. Why is there not greater detail on the funding source?

- ID 5011, Pawtucket/Central Falls Transit Center, is funded with a TIGER grant. All discretionary federal funds awarded through a competitive grant process are shown to use "discretionary" money.
- ID 7150, State of Good Repair Capital, is funded with FTA money.
- ID 1308, RT 1A, Old Post RD, uses Other Federal money as a source. This category includes several small grants that RIDOT receives on an annual basis; August redistribution, a federal practice that allows the state to spend federal funds in the categories where the obligation authority is most needed; and federal funds from closing out old projects.
- ID 9201, Reconstructing Pell Bridge Approach, uses Other Federal money as a source.

- RIPTA's projects indicate RIPTA Operating as a funding source in many of their projects. Is this 5307 or CMAQ funding being used to match other federal funds?

Federal funds, including 5307 funds and CMAQ funds, are never used to match other federal projects. While RIPTA's operating budget is shown inclusive of federal reimbursements, the line item for each project includes the non-federal share of the operating budget. Operations are supported by a combination of fare box revenue, state transportation funding, contract revenue and other revenue like advertising and leases. The major state contribution to the operating budget match is the Gasoline Tax, which is collected by the Division of Taxation with \$.0975 per gallon distributed to RIPTA.

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

- RIPTA’s operating assistance is listed under JARC. JARC was eliminated under MAP-21. Have the funding programs being used and referenced been updated for the FAST Act?

We continue to use funds for JARC but do so using Section 5307 funds. That is indicated in the TIP if you look closely at the funding sources.

- What triggers the ADA Plan field to be populated? The STIP appears inconsistent across similar projects as to whether that field is populated.

The ADA component was a carryover from the 2017-2025 STIP. Providing better information on projects with ADA components was performed with encouragement from FHWA to document projects that are consistent with RIDOT’s ADA Transition Plan (adopted September 2016). With cooperation from RIDOT, the Division of Planning is continuing to update this information and will include new project information as STIP updates are undertaken.

### Financial Planning

- In the TIP, what are your assumptions for inflation and how does the state account for unexpected cost increases for projects?
- In the TIP, how are contingency amounts incorporated into individual project estimates?

#### Expenditures

The STIP includes an expenditure line item for “contingency-inflation”. The total allocated to Contingency/Inflation is less than 2% of total ten-year expenditures but has been set aside to address these unplanned expenses. Below are RIDOT expenditures FY18-FY21:

RIDOT TIP PROGRAMS	FY 2018	FY 2019	FY 2020	FY 2021	SUBTOTAL
6/10 PROJECT	\$77.00	\$70.00	\$92.20	\$60.36	\$299.56
BRIDGE CAPITAL PROGRAM	\$205.70	\$209.60	\$160.00	\$135.90	\$711.20
BRIDGE MAINTENANCE	\$15.23	\$17.30	\$16.38	\$17.40	\$66.31
CONTINGENCY - INFLATION	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.41	\$0.50	\$0.91

On a program level, here is the contingency-inflation expense estimates:

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

CONTINGENCY - INFLATION											
ID 1427 CONTINGENCY - INFLATION											
<b>DESCRIPTION</b> This funding has been set aside for unanticipated repair or replacement costs for transportation assets.						<b>MUNICIPALITIES</b> Statewide					
						<b>LOCATION</b>					
<b>ADA PLAN</b>						<b>PHASE</b>			<b>SLR CONCERN</b> <input type="checkbox"/>		
Funding Source	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2025	2026	2027	(\$M) TOTAL
GasTax			\$0.41								\$0.41
Inflation				\$0.50							\$0.50
OutYear					\$0.70	\$4.30	\$0.50	\$0.50	\$9.00	\$9.40	\$24.40
<b>TOTAL (\$M)</b>			\$0.41	\$0.50	\$0.70	\$4.30	\$0.50	\$0.50	\$9.00	\$9.40	<b>\$25.31</b>

Regarding RIPTA, transit service is paid for with RIPTA operating budget revenues, with support from federal programs. According to RIPTA, all federally reimbursable operating expenses have been projected through the time frame of the STIP using inflation estimates and planning values provided by the State Budget Office.

RIDOT also uses a 2.5% inflationary increase for Federal highway sources (\$6M) in 2018-2021 with total column:

2.5 % Inflationary Increase from Federal Reserves	0.00	0.00	0.00	6.00	6.00
Planning	6.30	6.30	6.40	6.40	25.40

And for 2018-2027:

BRIDGE MAINTENANCE	\$13.73	\$17.30	\$18.38	\$17.40	\$20.31	2.41%	\$17.40	\$17.40	\$17.40	\$18.42	\$18.40	\$18.40	\$107.73	2.37%
CONTINGENCY - INFLATION	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.41	\$0.50	\$0.91	0.03%	\$0.70	\$4.30	\$0.50	\$0.50	\$9.00	\$9.40	\$25.31	0.39%
DEPT SERVICE	\$69.82	\$102.72	\$99.19	\$106.32	\$128.04	13.73%	\$102.24	\$101.64	\$96.41	\$77.40	\$76.85	\$67.57	\$900.16	13.78%

### Funding Sources

Rhode Island's gas tax was \$0.34 per gallon in FY 2017: this amount is scheduled to increase in even fiscal years based on indexing for inflation (\$0.35 in 2021).

- Are contingency amounts based on total estimated costs, identified project risks, or some other variables?
  - Some projects, such as the bicycle facilities that are scheduled to be funded by the State of Rhode Island's Green Economy Bond (GEB), the Safe Routes to School Program, and the Transportation Alternatives Program (TAP) each have their own separate contingency accounts.
- Or are contingencies based on one project in the TIP?

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

Regarding RIPTA, transit service is paid for with RIPTA operating budget revenues, with support from federal programs. According to RIPTA, all federally reimbursable operating expenses have been projected through the time frame of the STIP using inflation estimates and planning values provided by the State Budget Office.

- How does RIPTA plan to handle the projected operating deficit over the four-year TIP outlook?

RIPTA currently lacks the financial resources to fully meet their service standards in terms of length of service and frequency. In addition, RIPTA is unable to address the many demands for new service. While RIPTA has avoided a deficit in the FY 2018 budget through additional Highway maintenance funds from the General Assembly, RIPTA still needs to carefully balance service levels against the need and desire to expand transit services throughout the state. Using federal funds to support eligible operating costs requires trade-offs for capital investments to support state of good repair, fleet expansion and passenger improvements.
- For the TIP and the upcoming long range plan, how is an “adequate” level of operations and maintenance determined?

By investing in more up front bridge preservation efforts in the TIP, it is estimated that the state can save over \$20 million in bridge inspection and emergency bridge repairs over the time-frame of the STIP. RIDOT expects to in-source certain services, including striping, bridge inspection, and winter maintenance, which is expected to reduce soft costs over the time of the STIP. The maintenance program includes maintenance for bridges, pavement, traffic safety, drainage, and includes investment in staff. An asset management approach to maintenance means that every dollar invested today can save three dollars in costs in future years.

- Are needs derived from a desired level of service or rating of asset condition and how will these be met with expected funding levels?

A key component of the state’s vision to improve and preserve statewide transportation infrastructure over the next several years is the development of asset-centered programs that put the state on a path to eliminate structural deficiencies by the ramping up of maintenance investment to ensure future sound infrastructure condition. This is best achieved through a longer term, fiscally constrained vision than the traditional four-year STIP.

### Funding levels

- Winter maintenance- Maintenance Operations include programs such as Winter Operations, Mowing and Roadside Maintenance, Sweeping, and Traffic Operations. Winter Operations makes up the single largest share of Maintenance Operations. Costs vary widely based on the number, timing, and duration of snow and ice events and the cost of sand and salt, in conjunction with personnel and contractor expenditures. Based on a Winter Severity Index, 2012 was the least severe recent winter, with costs around \$8.0 million, while 2015 was the most severe, where costs more than doubled.
- Bridge- RIDOT expects to in-source certain services, including striping, bridge inspection, and winter maintenance, which is expected to reduce soft costs over the time period of the STIP. The RIDOT Bridge Inspection Unit is responsible to inspect these structures in

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

accordance with federal and state regulations. Routine maintenance and operations is periodically scheduled on all state owned and operated bridges. Typical operations are deck and expansion joint repairs, preservation work, and providing traffic control. The routine operations of bridge maintenance are typically funded entirely with state funds.

An asset management based approach to infrastructure funding is expected to save money over the long term through strategic repairs and immediate replacement on an as-needed basis. RIDOT maintains discretion over the bridge maintenance program as they prioritize needed repairs based on bridge inspections.

- Pavement- Each year, RIDOT invests over \$7 million dollars towards the Pavement Maintenance program. Selection of candidates for the various treatments is conducted through a blend of automated pavement distress data collection and visual pavement condition inspections carried out by a RIDOT Engineer. RIDOT maintains discretion over the projects addressed through the pavement preservation program.
- Traffic Maintenance- The RIDOT Traffic Maintenance Program handles damaged safety equipment that must be repaired or replaced. RIDOT maintains discretion over the Traffic Safety Maintenance as they service safety infrastructure that is broken, damaged, or in need of repair.
- Drainage- The Drainage Maintenance Program is directly related to Stormwater Consent Decree Compliance and includes a comprehensive plan to inspect and inventory Rhode Island's statewide highway drainage systems.
- Maintenance Capital (facilities)- The Division of Highway & Bridge Maintenance is responsible for the continued maintenance and upkeep of over 90 structures, ranging in size from 10'x10' storage sheds to its nearly 60,000 square foot Headquarters building. Each of these structures requires regular inspections, preventative maintenance and repairs in order to keep each asset safe and functional. The Division also maintains and operates a fleet valued at nearly \$60 million. Currently, RIDOT is exploring ways to modernize the fleet and is exploring all avenues, including leasing options and regional purchasing.
- RIPTA- The majority of RIPTA's Investment Program is dedicated to the maintenance and regular replacement of the buses and paratransit vans that provide over 18 million trips annually. This work is guided by asset management principles, focusing on the age of the vehicle with consideration of maintenance costs. Each year RIPTA makes targeted improvements to passenger facilities, prioritizing those investments based on ridership and importance to the system. Amenities at the roughly 4,000 stops in RIPTA's system range from basic signage at small bus stops to bus shelters, digital PROGRAM DESCRIPTIONS | 45 displays, and ticket vending machines at major hubs such as the Newport Visitors Center and Providence's Kennedy Plaza. Each stop is categorized for a particular level of investment. The agency plans to invest the appropriate level at each stop, balanced against the limitations of available funds.
- As Rhode Island develops its long-range plan, what types of historical data are used as a basis for preparing conceptual project estimates?

## 2018 RI Division of Planning Certification- Advance Questions

Project cost estimates are based on the expected year of construction and would begin with an order of magnitude estimate of costs. Unique factors such as project location or other risk factors would be evaluated on a case-by-case basis.

- How are the data adjusted for time (schedule), location and other project specific conditions?

In preparing long range plans, project cost estimating is informed by historic project bid prices from the most recent three to five years. These estimates are then escalated for inflation and adjusted according to schedule. Specific project conditions and risk factors (permitting, for example) are accounted for through increased contingency costs and escalation. Additional conditions such as impacts from sea-level rise would be accounted for by developing an overbuild estimate on a project by project basis, depending on the specific location and modeled SLR impact. The State of Rhode Island is already experiencing some of the effects of climate change, necessitating the consideration of its current and future effects in transportation and infrastructure planning.